

情不知所起，畫中而生 — 談《大畫昭君～觀落雁》的歷史翻案

文 / 簡韋樵 圖 / 臺北市立國樂團



2022年11月15日彩排記者會，前排左起為胖球、臺北市立國樂團陳鄭港團長、吳瑞呈指揮、歌唱詮釋指導魏世芬；後排左起為編導謝念祖、羅美玲、方宥心、孫協志、周明宇、林斌、呂紹齊。

在《大畫昭君～觀落雁》劇名中的「落雁」，取自於王昭君被譽為四大美人之一的比喻。當時昭君在和親途中，心有戚戚彈奏了一首動人《出塞曲》，而南飛的大雁一聽，注視到騎在馬上的這個美麗女子，卻忘記扇動翅膀，跌落在地。而「觀落雁」則是「觀落陰」的諧音雙關，除了備具趣味性之餘，還有「陰陽兩地」，包含漢宮與邊塞的遠距、生死永隔之意。猶如湯顯祖筆下的《牡丹亭》，杜麗娘在「夢」中初遇柳夢梅，致她春情難遣，對其懷有暮色之情；在《大畫昭君～觀落雁》中，「畫」，則成為毛延壽對昭君朝思暮想，情意傳達的信物。夢與畫皆能超越現實時空的限制，圓了有情者之想像。

然而，一首千年不可解的謎團「昭君出塞」，為何至今依舊受到眾人非議與猜度？為何封建時代從西漢至清代之末，許多皇親女子淪為和親制度的犧牲品，卻只有昭君能夠名垂千史，甚至擁有超過許多帝王將相、後宮妃嬪的關注度？

千年謎團，後人添筆

王昭君的事蹟，首先被以史筆記錄在班固書寫的《漢書·元帝記》裡，簡略地提及身為後宮良家子之一的王嬙（昭君之本名）被賜給匈奴呼韓邪，封為寧胡閼氏。而范曄《後漢書·南匈奴傳》與葛洪抄寫的野史小說集《西京雜記》，加入了民間口傳故事，概括出昭君為何相貌出眾、豐容靚飾卻只能久待深宮難以見御，導致其長期積累悲怨而主動要求和親，而在葛洪的編撰可見，原來一切都與昭君嚴拒被宮廷畫工索賄有關，使得畫工的奸邪小人的形象一直銘刻於後人之心。

尤其史上一齣被改編為戲劇文本的元雜劇《漢宮秋》，作家馬致遠深刻的將昭君與元帝關係，昇華為如膠似漆、生死之別之戀，被封為明妃的昭君也從前人描述的深宮怨婦轉為國犧牲、投江自盡的列女，並將畫工「毛延壽」描繪地詭媚狡詐、視錢如命，更和匈奴狼狽為奸，構成昭君出塞和番的始作俑者。爾後的明代流傳的《和戎記》、陳與郊《昭君出塞》、清代尤侗著作《吊琵琶》，乃至民國時期郭沫若創作的《三個叛逆的女性》之第二部《王昭君》（1923年），創作者越來越以昭君身為一名女性主體來發聲，重視她的心境和苦楚，除了將毛延壽描繪地人神共憤之餘，更突顯出元帝的懦弱和重色等負面形象，亦遭到讀者的唾棄。

繼協臺北市立國樂團（以下簡稱 TCO）合作的音樂劇《情人眼裡出西施》與《賽貂蟬》後，TCO 與全民大劇團（以下簡稱全民大）再推出四大美人系列之第三部曲《大畫昭君～觀落雁》，編導謝念祖帶領其他創作者再度「歪曲」史書，選擇幽默地推翻「毛延壽」以往被形塑的奸邪性格，揣度那句「意態由來畫不成，當時枉殺毛延壽！」（出自王安石〈明妃曲〉）之根由，將過往建構昭君與元帝、單于三人的感情線，改為昭君情歸毛延壽的異地淒戀，由孫協志飾演，以斯文的形象、王子般浪漫演繹，重塑與顛覆典型的人物性格。



左：由孫協志飾演毛延壽，以斯文的形象、王子般浪漫演繹，重塑與顛覆典型的人物性格。/ 右：歌手方有心於劇中飾演王昭君。



小演員胖球將飾演小昭君，與其他實力派歌手與演員同台飆戲。

「畫」的當代轉譯—眼圖與情書

劇中所謂的「眼圖」，為大漢朝廷用來政令傳達、展示疆域國土的工具。畫工替天子繪製漂亮的「政績」，用來愚民、呼喚百姓，亦包涵世俗認知的，他們為良家子作畫，收賄「修圖」。從前述提及，不管從正史、野史，到後世新產的諸多創作，那幅被畫醜的昭君「眼圖」，一直是造就「出塞」的主因。然而透過編劇書寫的異變，「畫」卻成為傳情的信物。當我們一直在突顯毛延壽貪財重利之際，卻沒想過他是否依戀著昭君的美貌，而特意不讓漢元帝選上？是否兩人因為相互思慕，等至昭君花信年華已過、得以出宮，彼此就能結為伉儷？

歷史是複數的，也存在大片空白任由後人詮釋與發揮。史冊留下縫隙與裂痕，似乎讓全民大抓到翻案的契機，以男性的慾望為主體書寫，而「畫醜」皆來自於昭君不願被皇帝選中，欲等老還鄉後，再和毛延壽相約出遊。經由當代創作者石破天驚地改寫，儼然成為一段浪漫的佳話。只是美好的想望總被突如其來的事件破局。

謝念祖曾在受訪提及：「張大春老師建議我們運用一幅畫、一幅畫呈現方式來講王昭君的故事，讓每一場戲都是一幅畫……『畫』可以把人困住，又可以帶人去任何想去的地方。」¹ 一幅幅在監獄繪製的畫作送到邊塞，宛如情書般深情款款，化作送別之禮、相思之信、辭別之書，將這段不得善終的戀曲彰顯現實殘酷性，令觀眾深刻共情。湯顯祖題記「夢中之情 何必非真？」，那畫中之情，又豈不是見證兩人的生死交會？

¹ 吳俞萱：〈畫中有深情 — 專訪《大畫昭君～觀落雁》導演謝念祖〉，《新絲路》第 82 期（臺北：臺北市立國樂團，2022 年 4 月 20 日），頁 6。

藉音樂之力，玩味古典

「一年歌劇，一年音樂劇」，是 TCO 在 2017 年推出「TCO 劇院」以來的跨界實驗與願景之一。尤其臺灣許多原創、大型戲劇皆有 TCO 的編制，如 2017 年《李天祿的四個女人》；2019 年《我的媽媽欠栽培》；2022 年《蔥仔開花》，以及和流行音樂跨界合作古裝音樂劇，包含先前 2015 年就與全民大首次合作的《情人眼裡出西施》，2018 年由張大春、周華健齊手合作的《賽貂蟬》；2021 年由王希文作曲的《當金蓮成熟時》，以及在《我的旁白人生》後第四度再與全民大合作的《大畫昭君～觀落雁》等，種種作品皆反映出將歷史與傳統體制的沉重包袱拋棄，並為跨時代女性發聲，共同創作出具新穎的形式和視界，獲得觀眾的眾多好評。

《大畫昭君～觀落雁》邀請具有古典音樂背景、灣聲樂團創辦人李哲藝擔任音樂設計，偕同吳瑞呈指揮和 70 多位 TCO 演奏家的龐大編制，揉合東方傳統樂曲和西方流行音樂，襯出張大春的歌詞抒情優美及悲壯磅礴。此劇的歌唱詮釋指導魏世芬在調教孫協志時，透過半年訓練期間，引出演員聲音裡的剛強和深情；劇中毛延壽和昭君在一虛一實的時間、記憶與現實的空間共唱，使觀眾也能隨著角色的孤寂而感到悲痛。而身為搖滾歌手的黃大煒，在謝念祖看來是最適合詮釋老單于一角，不僅演員本身有沉穩及異國風情的特質，其亦能發揮歌唱所長，找出不同共鳴位置振動聲帶，烘托出「邊塞」的疏異性。

然而原訂在 2022 年 5 月臺北市中山堂中正廳首演，由於疫情而延至 2023 年 1 月 6 日至 8 日共 4 場演出。雖然過了一年，但飾演昭君的方宥心經過半年的排練，卻對角色有新的體悟，而創作者也在劇中安排許多針砭時事的橋段，另外演員還額外發展出男男戀的耽美故事線，試圖用富饒趣味的情景來貼近觀眾的審美口味，將談諧逗趣的場面與令人不捨的主線戀情進行調和，本劇悲喜共存製造出豐富的視聽饗宴，值得期待。



《大畫昭君～觀落雁》音樂劇主要演員，左起：呂紹齊、羅美玲、黃大煒、孫協志、方宥心、周明宇、林斌。

Love Grows Where My Brushstroke Goes – A Review of *WANG ZHAOJUN*, the Musical's Attempt to Rewrite History

Text / JIAN Wei-Qiao

Image / Taipei Chinese Orchestra



The unorthodox *WANG ZHAOJUN*, the Musical is scheduled to show from January 6th to 8th, 2023 at Zhongzheng Auditorium, Taipei Zhongshan Hall.

In *WANG ZHAOJUN*, the Musical, the term “the fallen geese” praised the irresistible charm of WANG Zhaojun and thus landed her the title of one of the four classic beauties. Legend has it that Zhaojun played the heart-rending *Beyond the Great Wall* as she was sent off as a peace bride. The geese flying south heard the music and took notice of this fair maiden on horseback. The geese were so spell bound that they forgot to flap their wings and fell from the sky. The Chinese pronunciation for “the fallen geese that looked” is “guan luo yen”, a homophonic pun for “visiting the spirit of the dead”, “guan luo yin”. Aside from the mischievous pleasure the pun offers, the eternal separation between life and death is also borrowed to symbolize the unbreachable distance between the Han palace and the forlorn nother land Zhaojun is heading towards. Just like the *Peony Pavilion* written by TANG Xian-Zu. DU Li-Niang met and fell in love with LIU Meng-Mei in her dreams. She was dazzled by his good looks that no amount of waking hours could blur. In *WANG ZHAOJUN*, the Musical, the painting became the object that manifested painter MAO Yan-Shou's unrelenting love for Zhaojun. Both dream and painting are not bound by the limit of time and space. It is where imagination is free to conjure up a whole new world truly gratifying and to one's liking as a person in love.



Director HSIEH Nien-Tsu from All U People Theater and librettists vow to take you on an extraordinary journey through history and knock your socks off.

Why is the music piece *Lady Zhaojun Bidding Farewell* still seen as an unsolved puzzle after a thousand years? Why are people still speculating and criticizing over the story behind it? Many princesses suffered and lost their lives due to peace marriages from the Western Han dynasty to the Qing dynasty. How was Zhaojun different from the others? She received more attention than many emperors, courtiers, concubines, and consorts of the emperors did.

Unveiling the Thousand-Year-Old Secret

The story of WANG Zhaojun was first detailed in the *Book of Han : Annals of Emperor Yuan* by BAN Gu. WANG Qiang (Zhaojun's maiden name) was a lady-in-waiting in the palace of Han. She was married off to Huhanye and honoured as Ninghu Yanzhi (Chief-Consort Pacifying Hu). FAN Ye's *Houhanshu* (Book of the Later Han) and GE Hong's *Miscellaneous Records of the Western Capital* included folk tales describing the unapparelled beauty of Zhaojun and her lonely life in the palace of Han. Sick of wasting her days away in the palace, she volunteered to become the bride of Shanyu. GE Hong told the story of how Zhaojun refused to bribe the court painter and the stubbornness eventually lead her to her doom. The painter was made out to be a nasty and treacherous creature with no honor.

MA Zhi-Yuan depicted the relationship between emperor Yuan and Zhaojun in rich detail in his work *Autumn* in the Han Palace. He proclaimed their love to be overwhelming, passionate, and fierce. The unfortunate couple were kept apart by a separation as painful as death. Zhaojun, later honored as lady Ming, was no longer the unsatisfied lonely woman un-noticed and un-loved by the emperor. In fact, MA told the story of how she sacrificed herself for the peace of the empire and ended her life by throwing herself into the river. Painter MAO Yan-Shou was the appointed villain in the story. He was treacherous,

mean, and greedy. He consorted with Xiongnu and brought Zhaojun to her tragic fate. Later, *He Rong Ji*, a Ming play, CHEN Yu-Jiao's *Zhaojun Bidding Farewell*, YOU Dong's *Hanging Up Pipa*, and GUO Mo-Ruo's the second piece of the *Three Rebellious Women – WANG ZHAOJUN* in 1923 all told the story from Zhaojun's perspective, focusing on her struggles and pain. Painter MAO oppressed, cheated, and wronged her. At the same time, emperor YUAN's cowardice and superficiality were mocked by many readers.

All U People Theater (All U People) and Taipei Chinese Orchestra (TCO) worked together in *My Unseen Concubine*, and *My Farewell Lady*. The success led to the co-production of *WANG ZHAOJUN*, the Musical—the third piece of the four classic beauties. Director HSIEH Nien-Tsu and the other librettists strive to interpret the historical event with an innovative eye. They portrayed a totally different painter MAO in this new musical. WANG An-Shi's *The Song of Lady Ming* reads, "True beauty lies in one's quality, temperament, and disposition, thus was MAO Yan-Shou wrongfully executed." This implicated something else altogether. Emperor YUAN, Zhaojun, and Shanyu were no longer the only ones trapped in a love triangle. They suggested that Zhaojun was in fact the lover of MAO. Tony SUN plays MAO in the musical. He gives us a gentleman-like painter, who is the prince charming to Zhaojun. The brand-new interpretation surly stirs things up and gives us something to think about.

A Modern Look into Paintings – Propaganda and Love Letter

The Geng Tu mentioned in the musical is actually a form of propaganda used in the Han dynasty. The emperor uses Geng Tu to pass on policies or advertise the accomplishments of the empire. Painters produce exceptional paintings to educate the public, filling them with ideas pre-approved by the emperor. This includes editing portraits for ladies to make them look better. As we have mentioned before, in official historical records, folk stories, theatrical productions and fictions, the Geng Tu that failed to convey Zhaojun's overwhelming beauty sent her to her tragic demise. However, come to think of it, the reason behind this unsuccessful painting may just be the desperate attempt of a suffering man in love, trying to keep his lover away from the attention of the emperor. The lovers wished to lay dormant until Zhaojun is old enough to be sent away from the palace. They will then have a chance to live together as man and wife.

History is full of possibilities. The untold or unnoticed allows room for imagination to run wild in review. All U People found an angle into this well-known event and produced a musical based on the lust and hope of the male character. The unflattering portrait was the answer to a woman's desire to stay hidden. She wished to be released as an old maid later to be with her true lover MAO. The contemporary writers surprised us with this astonishingly turn of event and gave us a peek into a possible romantic love story. Sadly, happiness hardly lasts, it is always cut short by all sorts of accidents in life.



Vocal coach WEI Shi-Fen explains how she trains the singers.

HSIEH Nien-Tsu mentioned in one of his interviews,” CHANG Ta-Chun suggested that we tell the story of Zhaojun through paintings. Every scene revolves around a painting... Paintings are magical. They are capable of trapping you in or taking you to places you yearn to go.”¹ Paintings by the imprisoned painter were sent to the lonely northern land as love letters to say farewell, to tell Zhaojun how much he misses her, and eventually, to say goodbye before he perishes. The fact that this love affair was never truly realised accentuated the hard, cruel nature of life. Their trail touched the soft spot of many audiences. TANG Xian-Zu once argued, “who says love occurred in dreams cannot be real?” If that is so, isn’t the affection professed by paintings a testament to their love that transcends life and death?

Revisit Classics with Music

Since the beginning of TCO theatre in 2017, the orchestra has strived to put out “An opera one year and a musical the next.” Many originals and large theatre pieces are either commissioned or produced by TCO. For example, *The Four Women in Puppet Master Lee Tien-Lu's Life* in 2017, *My Mom Needs an Education* in 2019, and *Formosa Bloom* in 2022. There are also period musicals co-produced with the pop music world, including *My Unseen Concubine* in 2015 with All U People, *My Farewell Lady* in 2018 (by CHANG Ta-Chun and CHAU Wakin), *When The Lotus Blooms – The Musical* (2021) by Owen WANG and *My Aside-Like Life*. TCO worked with All U People for the fourth time to create *WANG ZHAOJUN, the Musical*. All these works attempted to rid of the baggage, expectations or assumptions that have long limited our imagination. The new interpretation means to speak for women today and in the past. This is a very innovative form and perspective that has been very well received by the audience.

¹ WU Yu-Xuan : Confessing Ardent Love with Painting – Interviewing XIE Nian-Zu, Director of *WANG ZHAOJUN, The Musical*; New Silk Road, No 82; (Taipei: Taipei Chinese orchestra, April 20, 2022) p6.



CHEN Cheng-Kang, General director of TCO, looks forward to the third piece of the four classic beauties – *WANG ZHAOJUN, the Musical*.

WANG ZHAOJUN, the Musical is composed by the founder of One Song Orchestra LEE Che-YI, who has a classic music background. Conductor WU Ruey-Chen and over 70 TCO musicians will join the actors and actresses on stage to perform a series of scores that has the attributes of both eastern traditional music and western popular music. The lyrics written by CHANG Ta-Chun are expressive, passionate, and magnificently eloquent. Under the training of vocal coach WEI Shi-Fen, Tony Sun learns to convey strength as well as passion with his voice. In the musical, MAO and Zhaojun complete each other in songs though separated by time, space, or reality. The audiences are able to feel the pain and loneliness, living vicariously through the characters. Rock'n'roll singer David WONG is, in HSIEH Nien-Tsu’s words, the perfect choice for Shanyu. He has a trustworthy quality that is also very exotic. The character also allows him to perform his singing ability to perfection. The excellent voice magician delivers a sense of alienation that is unique to the land outside the northern borders with a wide range of placement and resonance.

The musical was originally scheduled to debut in May 2022 at Zhongzheng Auditorium, Taipei Zhongshan Hall. Due to the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic, the performance was postponed to January 6th to 8th, 2023. There will be four performances in total. A year has lapsed since the scheduled debut. FANG Yu-Hsin, the actress playing Zhaojun gained a whole new understanding of the character during the wait. The writers also added many events implicating the phenomena in the contemporary world into the musical. Some actors even came up with an additional storyline of thrilling boylove. They try to appeal to the audiences with fascinating and intriguing arrangements. These humorous designs incorporated into the heart-wrenching story line make the audiences laugh and cry at the same time. It is a rich sensory journey that we invite you to join us on.