

國樂指揮的實作與挑戰 (上)

文 / 李明晏 (新加坡藝術大學 / 南洋藝術學院高級講師)

圖 / 臺北市立國樂團、李明晏、新加坡華樂團、新加坡華樂團、四川交響樂團、張宇安、江振豪

與西方管弦樂團發展的歷史比較起來，民族管絃樂團 / 國樂團可以說是相當新的樂種，若從大同樂會開始算起，國樂的發展至今僅有100多年。以臺灣中國音樂學系之系統化教育進展來看，先是培育演奏及創作人才，後才關注樂團指揮的培訓，也就是說，樂團指揮的系統性專業訓練，近十年來才開始受到重視。

本文主要訪問來自臺灣的指揮張宇安與江振豪；新加坡的指揮連汶華 (LIEN Boon Hua) 與倪恩輝 (Moses GAY Enhui)。張宇安為臺北市立國樂團首席指揮、江振豪為臺北市立國樂團副指揮；連汶華為新加坡國立大學楊秀桃音樂學院藝術指導與新加坡國家青年華樂團客席指揮、倪恩輝為新加坡國立大學楊秀桃音樂學院藝術指導與新加坡華樂團副指揮。

透過以上4位來自不同訓練背景青年指揮的線上訪談，相互討論下，了解他們在指揮實踐上的觀點及面臨的挑戰，並回顧他們一路走來接受的這些訓練，希望對於國樂指揮有興趣的人士，提供國樂指揮實作與挑戰的一些想法與觀點。



張宇安指揮臺北市立國樂團 (資料來源：臺北市立國樂團)
CHANG Yu-An conducting the Taipei Chinese Orchestra (Source: Taipei Chinese Orchestra)



作者李明晏訪問 4 位青年指揮：倪恩輝 (上左)、連汶華 (中左)、江振豪 (中右)、張宇安 (下)
Author LEE Ming-yen interviews four young conductors: Moses GAY Enhui (top left), LIEN Boon Hua (middle left), CHIANG Chen-Hao (middle right), and CHANG Yu-An (bottom)

問題一：我們都知道許多國樂作品蘊含著傳統音樂的元素，如：民歌、戲曲……等，但傳統音樂博大精深，要將之解讀後呈現出來著實不易，請問各位老師會如何去處理或探討樂曲中的這個部分？想瞭解各位老師在這部分如何進修？

張宇安：當作曲家有意用新的元素來寫作品時，他們寫的時候，其實心裡已經有這個聲音了，他只是嘗試用五線譜把它數據化的記錄下來，但記錄下來時，一定會流失掉某些東西和細節。我們嘗試把它的音高跟節奏數據化，將空間跟時間數據化的時候，就一定會流失掉一些東西。我認為理解西方交響樂作品對國樂作品的學習有極大的幫助與反思，因為它幫我抽離閱讀交響樂作品時系統化的想法，也讓我反思到，我們不能完全用數據化方式來詮釋國樂作品，而失去國樂作品的特色。

我們身為一個指揮，當然要用更高的標準要求自己，我們最好能夠更理解這些知識。有如之前中國國家京劇院訪臺，我整整一週都在看排練，聽鑼鼓。那些聲音恰好就是五線譜沒有辦法記錄下來的，這些，就是指揮的養分。但是這就像修行一樣，我覺得是出出入入，我們有更多的了解，我們或許就更能傳達給樂團。

倪恩輝：我13歲開始學二胡，師從張玉明老師，老師會安排一些有地域風格的練習曲，譬如蒙古、江南絲竹、陝北、河南……等作品。我在當兵時，被安排在越劇團擔任主胡，以上這些是我成長時間接受的訓練。華樂團排練往往僅有4小時，指揮要面對來自不同派別的演奏家們，大家都有自己的演奏風格與想法，對我而言，其實是相當不容易將我的想法傳遞給他們。也呼應剛剛宇安的说法，國樂團是使用西方管弦樂團的概念，因此關於風格上的使用，必須恰當，如果過於使用傳統音樂的概念，有時反而有負面的效果。

江振豪：如果我們沒有傳統音樂的背景，我們能不能做我們在指揮臺上的工作？其實也是可以，因為我們只要做決定就好。但有那些背景知識，可以決定我們的選擇，或者是決定我們的品味到哪裡，可以把我們成品的藝術性更加提升，到了某一個水準以上的時候，我們對民歌或者是戲曲的了解多深，就變成是關鍵，能不能讓我們的東西繼續突破的關鍵。我想，像我們這樣的年輕指揮，在學習的過程中，可能不會把大部分的時間僅僅花費在鑽研這個部分，但可能在我們的職涯正式開始後，我們會對這部分產生渴望，希望對音樂的理解還有詮釋走向更深的地方時，這些東西就變成非常不可或缺的事情。

連汶華：我非常贊同振豪的回應，身為一個年輕指揮，有很多基本功你必須要先處理好，當你80%的基礎打好後，如果要再進步的話，就會有下一個學習階段。最近剛剛上任的芝加哥交響樂團音樂總監克勞斯·麥凱萊 (Klaus MÄKELÄ) 才20多歲，相當年輕，人生經驗雖然可能不比其他年紀較大的指揮豐富，但從他的例子告訴我們，知識是需要時間去琢磨的，可是不代表你沒有知識就無法帶動樂團，我覺得這是非常重要的。當你年紀越大，你跟不同人所學的東西也會慢慢的累積，就像宇安說，你每次指揮的時候，你就是累積之前來自各家各派的音樂經驗。



指揮倪恩輝（資料來源：新加坡華樂團）
Conductor Moses GAY Enhui (Source: Singapore Chinese Orchestra)



連汶華於演出後獲得觀眾熱烈地喝彩（資料來源：四川交響樂團）
LIEN Boon Hua after an exhilarating world premiere performance
(Source: Sichuan Symphony Orchestra)



江振豪與演奏家黃立騰首演琵琶協奏曲《尋·耶婆瑟雞》（資料來源：臺北市立國樂團）
CHIANG Chen-Hao and musician HUANG Li-Teng premiered the Pipa Concerto Seeking Yurpaska (Source: Taipei Chinese Orchestra)

問題二：當前系統化、專業化的指揮訓練模式，都以西方音樂為主，但我們都知道，國樂指揮和西樂指揮，存在著不小的差異，而這樣的訓練背景與差異，是否會影響到您的排練。請各位老師以實例分享，排練國樂作品時，遇過最難處理的樂曲 / 樂段，而您怎麼用有效的方式達到您想要的成果？

張宇安：首先對於現在專業國樂團來講，當然很多技術上沒有什麼太大的問題，但是我覺得在複雜的節奏上面，可能對於原生國樂樂器演奏家還是會有一些需要去細究的部分。我覺得國樂演奏家會有一個很自然的習慣，就是他看到音的時候不會特別去細究。而西樂演奏家，他會先去算節奏，有點像是先理性的看它，然後再感性的詮釋。國樂演奏家，往往先從感性的那邊開始，但對於合奏上來講，我們還是必須先要求聲音跟大家合在一起。因此，節奏就是一個最基本的要素。所以在這一點上，指揮就必須細心去聽，究竟節奏的不穩定，是因為指揮自己呢？或者是樂團團員單純就是心裡沒有這個拍子、沒有在算。我覺得這些情況的區別，會影響到指揮練習的方式。

另外，自由段落、慢起漸快這些段落，其實是需要指揮心裡有很明確的樣貌後，加上足夠的技術，就能夠不用解釋地用手做出來。這件事聽起來好像很神奇，但它是可能，而且也是必須要有的。一個指揮如果有這個能力的話，一個好的樂團，最多只要三次，就能夠達到很完整的樣貌，即使這個節奏是多麼的複雜。所以其實主要因素還是在指揮手上。

倪恩輝：我覺得是現代派的作品相對比較麻煩，加上自由段落的部分是更難以解釋給團員。而音樂家們經常無法非常精確抓到聲音的順序。我覺得比較有效的解決方式，就是先把譜子先看好，然後與作曲家確認後，再進一步跟團員們清楚解釋順序，雖然比較花時間，但是最快的方法可能就是這樣吧！

江振豪：我覺得訓練背景並沒有影響到我的排練，因為所謂的訓練其實都是工具，我並不覺得這兩個東西它的差異是一種衝突。

我覺得跟語言有關的東西都會非常難，就像是跟戲曲有關的，因為沒有辦法精確記譜，但因為要合奏，它又必須取得整體性。這樣子的作品像《穆桂英掛帥》或《亂雲飛》；另外一種類型就是古曲移植，像《月兒高》或《春江花月夜》。這個東西我覺得必須要花時間去理解，理解那個語言，理解那個音樂背後的邏輯到底是什麼，我們的工作其實就是樂譜的翻譯機，我們把這個東西很好的翻譯給團員，團員透過我們的手勢就會很清楚的知道他們應該要演出什麼。所以對於指揮的工作，我自己覺得，除了我們自己的專業技術—手的部分以外，我們在理解文本，也就是樂譜上，要特別下功夫。

連汶華：國樂跟西樂指揮的確是有一些不一樣的地方，但是整體來說指揮的原則還是不變。比如說節奏精確或者聲響平衡的概念，其實不管是西樂還是國樂，我覺得都沒有差別，還是要處理這些基本問題。美國樂團在節奏精確度要求上是沒有讓步的，加上他們的基本功是非常好，所以很多職業樂團，第一個排練幾乎是80%，因此兩三個排練就可以上場了。歐洲的樂團就比較不一樣，他們可能對其他的音樂元素，例如音色或線條比較注重，有時候第一個排練可能聽起來有些不整齊，可是他們花的時間比較長，能比較充分的沈浸在音樂裡，所以他們演出來的東西可能更有味道，因為他們花時間去琢磨、去想、去思考。

（下集待續）

The Practice and Challenges of Conducting Chinese Orchestra I

Interview and Article / LEE Ming-yen

(Senior Lecturer, University of the Arts Singapore / Nanyang Academy of Fine Arts)

Image / Taipei Chinese Orchestra、LEE Ming-yen、Singapore Chinese Orchestra、Sichuan Symphony Orchestra、CHANG Yu-An、CHIANG Chen-Hao

Compared with the history of the development of western orchestras, the Chinese orchestra can be said to be a relatively new music genre. Dating from the beginning of Datong Music Society, the development of Chinese orchestra has only been for more than 100 years. Judging from the progress of systematic education in the discipline of Chinese music in Taiwan, the focus is first on grooming talented performers and composers, and secondly on the training of orchestra conductors. In other words, critical reflection on the systematic professional training of Chinese orchestra conductors has only begun to gain traction in the past decade.

This article features interviews with conductors CHANG Yu-An and CHIANG Chen-Hao from Taiwan, as well as LIEN Boon Hua and Moses GAY Enhui from Singapore. CHANG Yu-An serves as the principal conductor of the Taipei Chinese Orchestra, while CHIANG Chen-Hao holds the position of deputy conductor. LIEN Boon Hua is an artist faculty at the Yong Siew Toh Conservatory of Music and serves as a guest conductor for the Singapore National Youth Chinese Orchestra. Moses GAY Enhui is currently appointed as associate conductor for the Singapore Chinese Orchestra and the Singapore National Youth Chinese Orchestra, in addition to his role as music director of the National University of Singapore Chinese Orchestra.

Through the online interviews with these four young conductors from different training backgrounds, through our discussions, to understand their views on the practice of conducting and the challenges they face, and in reviewing the training they have received along the way, it is hoped that some perspectives on the practice and challenges of conducting Chinese orchestra can be offered to those interested in this field.



指揮張宇安 (資料來源: 張宇安)
Conductor CHANG Yu-An (Source: CHANG Yu-An)



指揮江振豪 (資料來源: 江振豪)
Conductor CHIANG Chen-Hao (Source: CHIANG Chen-Hao)

Question 1: We all know that many Chinese orchestral works contain elements of traditional music, such as folk music, opera, etc. However, traditional music is diverse and profound, and challenging to interpret and present. How would you manage or explore this aspect of the music? How would you engage more deeply with it?

CHANG Yu-An: When composers use new elements in their composition, they actually already have the sound in mind. They are just trying to transcribe this digitally, but when it is transcribed, something will be lost, certain things and fine details. When we try to digitize pitches and rhythms, and when we digitize space and time, something will inevitably be lost. "I think that understanding Western symphonic works is useful in my reflection, as it helps me to extricate myself from its systematic thinking; reflecting that we cannot rely solely on a data-based approach to interpret Chinese orchestral works, thus losing sight of what makes Chinese music distinctive.

As conductors, of course we must place higher demands on ourselves, and we ought to better understand this knowledge. Just like when the China National Peking Opera Company visited Taiwan, I spent the entire week watching rehearsals and listening to gongs and drums. Those sounds are exactly what the staff manuscript cannot record; these are the nutrients of conducting. But it is like spiritual practice. I think the more we understand, perhaps the better we can convey it to the orchestra.

Moses GAY Enhui: I started learning Erhu when I was 13 years old, under teacher ZHANG Yuming. Teacher ZHANG would arrange etudes featuring regional styles such as Mongolian, Jiangnan Sizhu, Northern Shaanxi, Henan, and others. When I was serving in national service, I was assigned to be the lead Erhu player in a Shanghai Yue Opera troupe. Such was the training I received in my formative years. Chinese orchestra rehearsals usually last only four hours, and conductors have to face performers from different schools. Everyone has their own playing styles and ideas. It is actually quite difficult for me to convey my ideas to them. Echoing what Yu-An just said, the Chinese orchestra uses the concept of the Western orchestra. Therefore, the application of style must be appropriate. If the concept of traditional music is over-applied, sometimes it will have negative outcomes.

CHIANG Chen-Hao: If we do not have a background in traditional music, can we do our job as a conductor? In fact, we can, because we just need to decide. Having that background knowledge can influence our choices, shape our preferences, and further enhance the artistry of our outcomes. When we attain and rise above a certain level, the depth of our understanding of folk songs or operas will hold the key to whether our product can continue to make breakthroughs. I think, young conductors like us may not spend most of our time studying this during the learning process, but maybe after our careers officially begin. This becomes indispensable as our understanding and interpretation of music deepens, our desire to delve deeper will grow.

LIEN Boon Hua: I very much agree with Chen-Hao's response. As a young conductor, there are many fundamentals you must sort out first. After you have dealt with 80% of that, if you want to progress, there will be a next stage of learning. Klaus MÄKELÄ, the recently appointed music director of the Chicago Symphony Orchestra, is only in his twenties. He is quite young and possibly has comparatively less life experiences than his other older colleagues. This example tells us that while knowledge takes time to develop, it does not mean that without knowledge, you cannot lead an orchestra. I think this is a very important point. As you get older, the things you learn from different people will gradually accumulate. Just like Yu-An said, every time you conduct, you amass previous musical experience from various sources.

Question 2: The current systematic and professional conductor training models are mainly based on Western music, but we all know that there are considerable differences between Chinese orchestra conducting and Western orchestra conducting. Does such training backgrounds and differences affect your rehearsals? Please share examples from rehearsals of Chinese orchestral works, explaining how you managed the most difficult pieces or sections and achieved the desired results effectively.

CHANG Yu-An: First of all, for today's professional Chinese orchestras, of course there are no major technical problems, but I think some Chinese music instrumentalists need to study complex rhythms carefully. I think Chinese music performers have a very natural habit, that is, they do not pay special attention when they read the music score. A symphony orchestra performer will calculate the rhythm first, as if looking at it rationally first, and then interpreting it emotionally. In contrast, Chinese music performers often begin with the emotional aspect. However, for ensembles, we must first require everyone's sounds to be integrated, so rhythm is the most basic element. Therefore, at this point, the conductor must listen carefully. Is the unstable rhythm due to the conductor? Or maybe the orchestra members simply do not have this beat in mind, not even counting the beat. I think such situational differences will affect the method of the conducting practice.

In addition, sections that include *ad libitum* or begin slowly and gradually accelerate require the conductor to have a clear vision and sufficient technical skills to effectively convey expression through hand gestures without explanation. This may sound magical, but it is possible and necessary. If a conductor has this ability, a good orchestra can achieve a complete form with only three attempts at most, no matter how complicated the rhythm is. So, in fact, the key factor still lies in the hands of the conductor.

Moses GAY Enhui: I think modern works are relatively more troublesome, and the free passages are more difficult to explain to the members. Furthermore, musicians often fail to capture the precise sequence of sounds. I think a more effective solution is to first read the score carefully, confirm it with the composer, and then explain the sequence clearly to the members. Although this takes more time, it is likely the fastest way.



指揮倪恩輝 (資料來源：新加坡華樂團)
Conductor Moses GAY Enhui (Source: Singapore Chinese Orchestra)



連汶華指揮新加坡交響樂團歡慶濱海藝術中心 20 週年 (資料來源：新加坡交響樂團)
LIEN Boon Hua conducts the concert celebrating the 20th anniversary of Esplanade of Chinese Music. (Source: Singapore Symphony Orchestra)

CHIANG Chen-Hao: I feel that my training background has not affected my rehearsals, because the so-called training are tools, and I do not think the differences between the two pose any conflict.

I think anything related to language will be very difficult, just like opera-related tasks, because there's no way to memorize the music accurately, yet it's essential for orchestral performance and must be integrated. Works like this are like *Mu Guiying Takes Command* or *The Surging of Messy Clouds*. Another type is the transplantation of old classics, such as *The Moon Is High* or *A Moonlit Night on the Spring River*. I think we must spend time to understand these; understand that language, and understand the logic behind the music. Our job is actually to translate the music score; we translate this thing superbly to the musicians, and the musicians will, through our gestures, know very clearly how they should perform. Therefore, regarding the work of a conductor, I personally feel that in addition to our own professional technical skills - the work of the hands - we must work hard to understand the text, that is, the music score.

LIEN Boon Hua: There are indeed some differences between conducting Chinese orchestra and Western orchestra, but overall the conducting philosophy remains unchanged. For example, the concept of precise rhythm or balance of the sound, in fact, I think there is no difference between Western orchestra or Chinese orchestra. These basic issues still have to be addressed. For example, American orchestras have high expectations about rhythm and pulse, and they have strong technical abilities. Therefore, for many professional orchestras there, the first rehearsal is almost 80%, so two or three rehearsals are sufficient to get on the stage. European orchestras are different. They are more attuned to other aspects of music, such as colour or sense of line, and sometimes the first rehearsal could even sound a bit messy. However, they spend longer time with the music, allowing them to soak it in, resulting in more nuanced performances, so their performances may seem more nuanced, because they have had time to ponder over it, mull over it, think about it.

(Next episode to be continued)